

PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATCHITOCHE PARISH COUNCIL
PARISH OF NATCHITOCHE, STATE OF LOUISIANA
TAKEN A REGULAR MEETING HELD, MONDAY,
October 17, 2016
5:30 p.m.

The Natchitoches Parish Council met in regular and legal session in the Council Board Room of the Natchitoches Parish Courthouse, on Monday, October 17, 2016 for a Regular of Natchitoches Parish Council meeting at five(5:30) o'clock p.m. and for the Natchitoches Parish Council Meeting.

The Parish of Natchitoches was then convened as the governing authority by Chairman Russell Rachal who stated that the Parish was ready for the transaction of business.

The invocation was given by Councilman Doug de Graffenried and the Pledge of Allegiance led by Councilman Russell Rachal.

After the roll call there were present Chairman Russell Rachal and Council: Rodney Bedgood, Doug de Graffenried, Chris Paige, and Patsy Ward-Hoover.

Absent: None.

Chairman Rachal advised the next order of business is to amend the agenda to place one item on the Agenda.

1. Council to consider Introduction of amendments to the Natchitoches Parish Personnel Manual.

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Doug de Graffenried that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby amend agenda to add Council to consider introducing amendments to the Natchitoches Parish Personnel Manual.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|-------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item was for the adoption of the agenda with the added amendment.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt the Agenda.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|-------|---------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal then asked for visitors at this time.

At this time Ms. Jessica Broadway a representatives from Johnson, Thomas, & Cunningham Auditing Firm came to the podium and gave a summary on the Audit, which was done for the Natchitoches Parish Government. The Audit was done on June 30 and it did go in on time.

The opinions that were issued on this report was a clean audit opinion, however, there were two findings in the report, both were internal controls one was on cash collect and the other a major program compliance which had to do with OCS/Head Start programs. At this time she asked if the Council had any questions.

Councilman Bedgood asked, "What was the problem with it? Was it for the Head Start \$57,000?" Jessica expressed what they had figured out so far it was overdrawn, when I say overdrawn, "I mean too much money was collected." Ms. Jessica, stated, "Ms. Debbie is working on that, At this time the money may have already been sent back." Ms. Debbie, stated, "The money was there, sitting in the cash account, it was just too much money."

Councilwoman Hoover, replied, "Senior Companion." Ms. Jessica, stated, "Senior Companion is just they requested too much money apparently. That is the cash balance in each of these accounts, which should be zero balances." Councilwoman Hoover, asked about the Child Care had \$38,799 balance in it's account." Ms. Broadway, stated, "That's an issue from a few years back." "They don't want the money back in that account?" Ms. Broadway, asked Ms. Miley this question to confirm her answer. Ms. Miley, stated, "That was an old account just sitting there so is Senior Companion."

Councilwoman ask, "So they want the money back from the two Head Start as well for Senior Companion?" and Jessica and Ms. Miley agreed, "Yes, for Head Start. Jessica stated, "We haven't heard anything back from Senior Companion as far as wanting the money back." Jessica, explained, "We recorded as a Cash Balance in the Audit report and they reviewed it."

Councilman Chris Paige wanted to back up and discuss the \$53,000. He asked, "It has been sent back?" Ms. Miley, stated, "The \$53,000 is from a fund 141. This fund was from 2012-2013. It is one we took over that we've been reconciling trying to figure out where the money came in play to send it back. We use to do the funds every three years we'll roll around and it's not as easy to do just a bank, I mean a general ledger reconciliation. I'm not sure how it got there, this is one that we took over, when the previous accountant retired." Councilman Paige, "Did you, Ms. Miley ever ask the previous accountant to come back to assist?" Ms. Miley, stated, "She said it was ours, but obviously it's not." Councilman Paige, asked, "So you could not get her back up here to explain where the money is at or whatever." Ms. Miley, stated, "No, I haven't tried to get her back up here." Ms. Jessica Broadway explained Head Start usually conducts an audit every year, and they haven't done an Audit since 2012. Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "So you say Head Start is responsible for this," "I'm not saying, their responsible, I'm just saying normally it wouldn't have gone on this long." stated Ms. Jessica Broadway.

Councilwoman Hoover then started to read from Page 3 of the Audit, the Natchitoches Parish Government didn't have sufficient internal controls in place to reconcile the cash collecting to the bank deposits on a daily basis. Ms. Broadway explained, "We had this issue before in 2011 and 2012 at that time they came up with a process. One person would take the cash and deposit it, and at the end of the month they would reconcile it based on the planning reports. They would check it off if that money had been deposited. We've checked this every year since 2013 and 2014. At some point in 2015 that process kind of broke down, but there was a system in place." Councilwoman, Hoover, asked, "Ms. Miley have that system been fixed?" Ms. Miley, answered, "Yes, I've hired another employee and that employee is doing the checking."

Parish President, expressed, "Like Jessica emphasized, it wasn't done on a daily basis, we had a problem, Debbie's staff found it. If we

were doing this on a daily basis we would have found it within twenty four hours. This occurs over a three month period, November to January. The changes that have been made in Debbie's office is another person is involved in the process and they are checking on a more frequent basis so a situation like that wouldn't go unnoticed." Councilman Bedgood stated, "Because only one was signing right, the checks?" Ms. Miley explained one person was taking the money and ultimately when I was out on leave it was only two people, so between the two people they were not checking it". Councilman Bedgood, asked "Have we changed that, you have changed that now?" Both Parish President and Ms. Miley, stated, "Yes". Councilman Bedgood, asked again, "This has been changed signature wise I'm talking about." Ms. Miley, explained there is two signatures on the check, two people signs every check." "Two signed it then?" asked, Councilman Bedgood. "Our signatures are electronic, our check are printed electronically." replied Ms. Miley. Ms. Miley explained now on the payable side we have a person checking what another person is doing."

Councilwoman, Hoover, asked, Ms. Miley to explained that to her, "I'm kind of lost on that one." Ms. Miley explained one person does payable and somebody else takes it and they check it off, or they call it out to the other person, between the two, as before, we only had one person doing the checks and half the time it wasn't being done."

Councilman Bedgood, "I'll like to make one more statement," "There was cash involved too right?" Ms. Miley explained, "The cash was taken from the person that was taking the checks and cash, and signing off to the other person that was they was getting it from, but they wasn't putting it in the bank, it never entered the safe." Councilman Bedgood, stated, "We really don't know how much cash that was actually taken, Do we?"

Ms. Miley, stated, "Yes, we know, we went through the whole year."

Councilwoman Hoover, wanted to know exactly how much was taken, because she was looking at the Audit report and it read that a Parish employee had misappropriated governmental funds. The employee admitted. "We know nothing about it as the Council." that he admitted to the misappropriation of funds." She continued to read, and was terminated immediately, at this time the amount of the misappropriated funds and the exact time period in which the theft occurred is unknown." "This is your report, Ms. Broadway". Councilwoman Hoover, replied. The misappropriated is estimated to be at least \$6,000.00 dollars. "Have we found out exactly how much money has been taken and what time period in which it was taken?" Ms. Miley, replied, "It was a little over \$6,000, I don't know the exact figure maybe a little over \$6200 or \$6300. Restitution was made. This was about a 4 months period, we had a reconciliation with Planning and Solid Waste. We have it not the auditors. We did it."

Councilwoman Hoover went on to explain, "Ms. Miley this is your department and this has been going on for a period of time. We have a responsibility as this Council to give account of monies for this Parish. It appears to me that you're lacking in some areas, that we can not give, because we just found out about this three months ago about this money. We was never told that amount and it no transparencies what so ever."

Ms. Miley, replied, "It was discussed in a Executive Session right after this happened, so it was more than three months ago, you're incorrect." Councilwoman, replied, "All of us are here and I don't think anyone of the Council would say that the amount of money was given."

Parish President, stated, "I brought it to your attention at an Executive Session of the Council." Councilwoman Hoover, asked, "Did anyone hear the amount?" Chairman Rachal, stated, "It was January 11, when we were sworn in, he did tell us about a theft of some type, but he didn't know the number at that time." Parish President, replied, "At the beginning of February or March we all set and discussed it." Chairman Rachal, replied, "At that time it was under investigation and it wasn't for the Council to know the investigation side of it." Councilman Paige, stated, "Yes, we did need to know." Chairman Rachal, replied, "No we didn't it was under investigation at that time, we would have tampered with the investigation at that time."

Councilman Paige requested to speak at the time. He explained, "We're talking about transparencies, and one thing for sure we did not know. We was told the individual was let go, we never knew a dollar amount. Basically when this was discuss, going through the process, as you say, "Not knowing anything." You know years if someone stole diesel gas out there, the community knew because we would let the people know about it. Now the last statement that it stated it was for the president and the Council, not to talk about money missing and not for the public to know. I don't know why the statement was put there. Don't care where you at if someone has taken the money they report the theft, one thing for sure, in the last meeting I made the comment if money has been taken, this Council needs to know and Has the money been replaced? Have we got that money back?" "Ms. Miley, said, "Oh, we got that money back." That was the first we had ever heard of that. You can sit around here and say, we knew, but I don't know who know. I would like to know, as the representative from the District I serve. And not get bits and pieces from employees and everybody else that possibly hears the gossip. We need to know facts about when these things happens. And not sit here an not be so transparent. Plain and simple and when I made the statement last month, Why this statement was sent to us, not to be spoken about. I don't know where that come from." At this time Mr. Mark Thomas began to explain about the audit report, when they get finished with an Audit report, the agency has an audit report with all the agencies letters and opinions in it. Then those are sent to the local government and then to the Legislative Auditor's office, within days when it gets to the Legislative Auditor's office it becomes a matter of public records. Some don't look for it because it not a common thing. "Our audit report doesn't even state you can't discuss it openly and that it's not for general discussion. What we do at the same time we issue our audit report we send our letter which is a professionally federal requirement, stating that we're done an audit and this is what we found, goes straight to you guys, specifically if you don't get this audit report, not intentional that anyone would do that, that's why they make us start using that letter, if the Council didn't get it at least you got this letter. Now the reason it says don't discuss beyond this because the letter you got does not have all the pages of the detailed audit has with our opinions and details. If you're looking at that letter you're not getting the whole story, it does has a restriction on it because it's not to be just given out, because it doesn't include when we actually give our opinions." So really when you get your audit report, you can throw that letter away.", And then you can say, "Now I got what, I need."

Councilman Paige then started to talk about the polling place, which a person was suppose to be paid \$500.00 and then asked for an increase of a \$1,000, but in actuality he was paid \$2,000 at the beginning of the year. Councilwoman Hoover, asked, "How can we be balanced, if you're telling us you're asking the Council to raise \$1000 and he was getting \$500.00 and wanting to raise an additional \$1000.00 when actuality he's getting \$2,000. How do your books balance?" Ms. Miley stated, "The amount is put in at the first of the year." Councilwoman Hoover stated, "There is no check and balance, there is no check and

balance." Ms. Miley, replied, "Ms. Hoover, "I've been working with three people, I have worked with a staff that isn't really two month old. In 2014 the accountant for Head Start came in and said, "I'm retiring, the same month the Assistant Treasurer, said, "I'm going to get married and move to Dallas." "I was left with a person that have been here only a year and was part time. I understand there were mistakes but we have been working with very limited resources. We've just now getting a third person and a fourth person, which is part-time. My office needs four to five people. We have taken on more with this, at this point with Grants more than anyone else has been doing. I apologize, but that was the best we could do, at that moment. We have tried, and trying to do better."

Councilwoman Hoover, accepted Ms. Miley apologies, but stated, "I hope you can understand, my position as representing Natchitoches Parish, because when I go to Wal-Mart and other places in this community, I have a thousands questions thrown at me, that I can't answer. You guys are the professionals that handles the day to day operations, experts I should say, so I'm looking for the experts to give me the information, so I can accurately give it to the people that I work for. I'm just a servant of the people. I need to have all information correct. And yes, we all make mistakes and we should work together in order to try and correct these things. We do not want to keep anything from the public, that shouldn't be kept. All of us are servants around here, the people of this Parish are our bosses and we have to give in account to them."

Parish President, stated, "I think Councilperson Hoovers comments are well taken," Thank you Sir", replied Councilwoman Hoover. Parish President continued to say, "The person that issued the higher than required payment is the person who caused the other problems, we just got through talking about. We was discussing at the time a renewal of the lease with a higher term, we was looking at having it refunded or starting over or we can let the payment go for a longer period of time. It's several ways we can work it out. I think it's clear though, we can do a better job communicating with the Council than we've done."

Councilman Paige, stated, "That's the point we're at, we shouldn't be kept in the dark, we need to know." The money that was given to the gentleman was illegal to give. We need to see about getting this money back, because if you have given it to me, you've been knocking on my door. We need to see about getting that money back and we need to see about a possibility of getting another voting precinct. We should not be held hostage like that by any individual. When you get to talking about other voting precincts and people wanting to be paid, and when you have people do this, we're digging a grave. Some do it for their civic duty, and other's wanting to keep going up on prices, I just don't see this continuing to happen."

Councilman Bedgood and Councilman Paige began discussing other issues such as utilities to the voting precinct, the Water system doesn't pay anything. The Parish owns the building. Chairman Rachal, stated, "We definitely need to look into this." Ms. Miley, stated, "You also need a septic system there." The Council will revisit this later at next month meeting.

Janice Perry, visitor, wanted to know, "Was this the audit you requested on last month meeting?" Chairman Rachal, stated, "No." Both Chairman Rachal and Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "It was for a Legislative Audit." Ms. Perry, stated, "What they gave you was not the one you requested?" Councilwoman Hoover, replied, "No." Ms. Perry, replied, "I know the Council voted to have the Legislative Auditor to come in." I was just trying to see was these the people you requested. So this was just a local firm that has come in to do the books?" "Okay, my next question is this, "How is it that you all, our Council

members, that represents the tax payers of the Parish, How is it that anything that goes on with the finance of the Parish and decisions are made and you're never aware of it? You represent me. So say, I come tell you, "Ms. Ward, they tell me that somebody stole ten thousands dollars from the Parish. And this is my money now, because I pay the taxes, it's part of my money, and then you tell me, "What?" "They stole, What?" and you're not aware of it, "How is that the decision with the money is made? "The decisions with the money, Are they made just by her alone? or If it's an Executive Session, You, the Parish Councilman, should be aware. How is it that decisions are made on this kind of money and you're not aware of it? or included in it to give a voice to say, "What are we're going to do?" So if you meet me on the streets and I tell you, "Somebody stole ten thousand dollars and you can't tell me anything. You sit on the Council and can't tell me anything about it, Parish money!" "Do that make any sense?" "No, Ms. Perry, replied, Councilwoman Hoover. "There is a problem," stated Ms. Perry. Councilwoman Hoover explained, "I only been on this Council since January, I'm putting my feet forward in order to try and correct some of these problems along with the other Councilman. I just went through the analogy you gave. I was faced with that because I didn't know anything at all." Ms. Perry stated, "I'm looking at you, my representative to be loyal to the tax payers. I'm looking at you to keep me abreast as to what's going on with our Parish and you're sitting here and you're part of the Council and you can't tell me what's going on with the Parish and the money. How can we trust anything with the Parish?"

Chairman Rachal, stated, "Ms. Perry all this money that being discussed tonight, was taken prior to this Council being seated for the first time. It didn't happen under our tenure. We were advised, there was some money missing, but at that time we didn't know how much. I think we have already agreed upon we need to be more transparent with each other. The money was not taken under this administration right here." Ms. Perry wanted to ask, "When can it be done, that you can take a vote, that anything that goes on with the finances of the Parish that you all should be made aware of it?" Ms. Perry went on to explained that she cares about the people of Natchitoches, she didn't care about people not liking her, but she cares about the people of Natchitoches. She went on to explain that she set on the Home Rule Charter Commission and she was then, like she's now, concerned. Ms. Perry, stated, "I asked all those questions, Who is going to look over our finances? Who is going to take care of the People? Who's watching out for the people working for the Parish?" Ms. Perry continued to express, when it comes to money being taken, misplaced, The Council should never be in the dark with that, The Council should be knowing everything that's going on when it comes to the employees termination, employees being hired, you need to be aware of it, not that you have the final decision, you just need to be aware of it, so the people can be aware of it.

Mr. Danny Von Kanel, of L.P. Vaughn Elementary school wanted the Council to be aware of L.P Vaughn 5k Run and Walk, which will be November 19, 2016, start time 10 a.m. (Saturday), Northwestern State University Fine Arts Building, Natchitoches. He also wanted to inform the Council about the Fine Arts Fair Luncheon with guest speaker, Mr. David Pickler and it will also be November 19, 2016 at 12:00 Noon, and the Cost will be \$25,00 a person including meal, in the L.P. Vaughn Cafeteria. Music will be by Hardrick Rivers. He also wanted to share that the school received a Grant of \$2,000 from the New Orleans Jazz Heritage Festival of New Orleans, LA. He also explained the School of Fine Arts, 12 classes for 12 weeks, open to all Natchitoches Parish Schools (Cost \$180.00) and \$150.00 Scholarships for L.P. Vaughn Students (Your Cost: \$30.00) Registration begins November 19. Jan-April 2017 L.P. Vaughn School of Fine Arts a place to explore your Fine Arts Interest. Your choice of private lessons or groups classes

in a variety of subject areas: art-keyboard, guitar, drums, violin, and more!

Mr. Tony Davis from the Natchitoches Parish Chamber of Commerce wanted to give an update of the Natchitoches Community Alliance Foundation, Inc. He wanted to inform the Parish about the new site which enhance and maintain parish wide economic development website and another area is to respond to request for proposals (RFPs) the NCA is working on 14 business leads in the following three economic development business sectors:

Manufacturing 6-projects
Retail/Restaurant 6-projects
Distribution/Services 2-projects

Mr. Davis, ask, Was there any questions for him? Parish President wanted to know if Mr. Davis could share those local organizations that are members of the Natchitoches Community Alliance. Mr. Davis responded by saying, "All utility providers, Mr. Robert Breadlove, with the Port Commission, Parish Government, Northwestern State University, and the City of Natchitoches." At that time asked, Was there any other questions? There was none.

Ms. Yolanda Jefferson wanted to know, What is going on with Coco Bed Road? and Parish President, stated, "The last time you met with the Council, we reported of a meeting with the Facility and Planning and Control, we've been battling this concerning the Design Phase of it for a long time. They asked us to do certain things, and providing certain information. We had the local District Attorney to write a brief history about the road. We contacted them several time since then and we wrote and told them we have given you everything you asked for. They told us in August, if we do A, B, and C then they will have no objection for permitting the design. We haven't gotten a response yet." Ms. Jefferson stated, "So it won't be this year?" Mr. Verret, stated, "This is the wrong time of the year, anyway." Parish President, stated, "We have to get their approval before we do anything." Our match is \$93,000 and some work that's being done by Mr. Verret, the engineering part of it, will not cost."

Mr. John Hodgeson wanted to thank Mr. Verret for coming out and fixing the Pardee Road it helped by 20%, and that's a bunch for that road. If you would have done the tax five years ago, but it's to late, I don't think it will pass now, maybe you need to do a Press Conference, you haven't reached a lot of people. to know what exactly what you're wanting. Well tomorrow I'll be Ted Dumas Show from 7:30 to 8:00 talking about the tax.

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was to adopt the minutes of the regular meeting of the Natchitoches Parish Council held Monday, September 19,2016.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt the minutes of the regular meeting of the Natchitoches Parish Council held Monday, September 19, 2016.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next agenda item was for Council to authorizing the Purchasing Agent to seek sealed bid proposals

for materials and supplies for the Parish Highway, Solid Waste and Head Start Departments.

On motion by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby authorize the Purchasing Agent to seek sealed bid proposals for materials and supplies for the Parish Highway, Solid Waste and Head Start Departments.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was to conduct a public hearing to hear any and all comments or objections relative to the adoption of the following items:

1. Council to approve the Adoption Of Ordinance #07-2016 a budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2017 and ending December 31, 2017 and making appropriations for each Department, Project, and Account.
2. Council to consider Adopting of Ordinance 008-2016 for speed limit change on Eight Mile Loop.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby open the public hearing to hear any and all comments or objections relative to the adoption of the following items:

1. Council to approve the Adoption Of Ordinance #07-2016 a budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2017 and ending December 31, 2017 and making appropriations for each Department, Project, and Account.
2. Council to consider Adopting of Ordinance 008-2016 for speed limit change on Eight Mile Loop.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

There was no one in the audience to have anything to discuss on these two items. The Council had a short discussion on both items. The Council asked, Mr. Verret, "What's the speed limit now and what it's changing to? Mr. Verret, informed the Council the speed limit was Thirty Five mph(35) and wanting to change it to Twenty Five mph (25) only to a certain portion of the road.

Its about an 0.8 mile section of this road that is located immediately west of its northern crossing of Interstate 49 where there are several successive horizontal and vertical curves that have limited sight distance.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby close the public hearing to hear any and all comments or objections relative to the adoption of the following items:

1. Council to approve the Adoption Of Ordinance #07-2016 a budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2017 and ending December 31, 2017 and making appropriations for each Department, Project, and Account.
2. Council to consider Adopting of Ordinance 008-2016 for speed limit change on Eight Mile Loop.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Rachal

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was Adopt Ordinance #07-2016 a budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2017 and ending December 31, 2017 and making appropriations for each Department, Project, and Account.

On motion by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt Ordinance #07-2016 a budget for the fiscal year beginning January 1, 2017 and ending December 31, 2017 and making appropriations for each Department, Project, and Account.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Abstain: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was to adopt Ordinance 08-2016 for speed limit change on Eight Mile Loop.

On motion by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt Ordinance 08-2016 for speed limit change on Eight Mile Loop from 35 mph to 25mph.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was for Council to consider an appeal file by Joyce Perry of a Zoning amendment/correction for the SOPEC Trust, Peter Cloutier Trust and Margaret Cloutier Shaw of a parcel of land. Approved in the October 3, Planning & Zoning Meeting.

Mr. Greg Lemoine, Planning and Zoning Director, explained the appeal, that was in front of the Council. "In August, a couple of people came to me inquiring about a zoning correction/amendment on a couple of parcels of land, they were historically businesses occupants. I told them how the process was, they came to the September, Planning and Zoning meeting talked about the corrections to the Zoning. I gave you this map showing how the property is booked in on both ends by businesses occupancies, and the other parcel that is next to it. To Council voted to take it to a Public Hearing in the October meeting, between the September meeting and the October meeting we did our requirements, we mail out letters to all the property owners, advertisement in the paper three times, and at the Public Hearing in October two people spoke in support and two spoke in opposition to the Commission. The Commission looked at the material and the maps, and they voted unanimously to approve the Zoning correction/amendment. You know anytime you have a Zoning amendment/change in both cases one side happy, and one side is unhappy. The parties of the unhappy is filing an appeal. We did nothing wrong at our meeting, we did what we suppose to do. The only question that came up at the appeal process and that was clarified by our Parish Attorney.

Joyce Perry stood and she said she was in opposition but, Mr. Jimmy Atherton, will be the spokesperson explaining why they're appealing the decision of the Planning and Zoning Board. This party handed out a package for the Council to see, what they were appealing. Mr. Atherton pointed out by stating "The decision was erred in at least two parts. First part being that there's a misunderstanding in our opinion in those documents and I guess can be verified through the Audio Tape of the Planning and Zoning Meeting. There was an assumption that a business property adjacent to this indeed was a Residential property and the second part is that the application that was presented to the Planning and Zoning Commission required certain things by law and the Zoning Commission Appendix A it was in violation of this. We would like the Parish Council to take time to review what we presented and take the matter under advisement, you have 45 days according to law, as we understand in the appeals process. To study both sides, like you said some people are happy and some are not, but we're asking for you to study what we presented, and what is not in that package is your own Ordinance of the Planning and Zoning Commission, Appendix A, we didn't print that out for you, and there is an audio tape you can get to listen to from the proceedings of that meeting."

Chairman Rachal, asked, "Your contingent is that the Parish property is zoned a R-2, and the Zoning Commission zoned it as a B-3, you look at the map here, the piece of land we're talking about its showing R-2, correct, Mr. Lemoine." Mr. Lemoine, stated, "Yes, its a R-2 with special exception to conduct business, it is considered a business occupancy as a R-2. They got approved from the Planning and Zoning Commission on January 7, 2013 to conduct business there." Mr. Atherton, replied, "That is correct." The question comes up in the audio tape, in error I think, stated it was actually B-3, and it was a R-2 with exception, but it was stated a B-3 in the meeting by accident." Councilwoman Hoover, asked, "So it was an error somewhere?" Chairman Rachal, asked, "So it's was a R-2 with special exception to conduct business, back in 2013?" Mr. Atherton, stated, "I know it's a lot of information here, you need time for it to digest, we can come back in front of this Council to look at it and discuss it. Please look at Appendix A .We need a decision made and we know you have the authority to nip it in bud, you have the ability to do that."

Councilwoman Hoover, express she would like to table it so the Council can have enough time to review the material from both sides, due to fairness to all persons.

Councilman Paige wanted to say, "The Planning Commission study this stuff many times, they went over it. This is part of the process and the Council can undo what they have decided, but, also with them voting unanimously that's a bit a tough pill for me to look at, but I'm willing to do whatever we need to do to come to some closure for the people. I would like to hear all sides, like you're saying if we're going to listen, we have heard your side and we certain would like to hear the other side as well."

Jack Duty came to express his concern he realize the Council does hard work, diligent work, and he has spent twenty years in Real Estate mainly in the City of Natchitoches, some in the Parish. I would just caution the Parish Council that if you start reversing the Planning and Zoning Commission decision, you're going to open a whole can of worms, you will have to deal with more and more of this kind of dispute, it want be Parish business anymore trying to work on the budget and roads and everything, you're gonna be working on where this property line goes, where this railroad goes, where this petition goes. I agree yal study it, I don't have no problem with that, but I caution you in over turning the Planning and Zoning Commission decision, that you're opening the doors to a whole lot more pettiness, I think. People will begin to say, "Well we can go above the Planning and Zoning heads" this will create a nightmare for yal."

Melissa Cloutier, stated, "I'm one of the property owners, Susan Cloutier here is another property owner and there is really a third property owner, my aunt, Margaret Cloutier Shaw, she lives in Jacksonville, Florida, and we have a letter that we can actually speak for her. I guess, I need to explain the original use of the property why we asked to get it amended and corrected. It was always used commercially, The Cane River National Heritage area has given us a Historic Standing Structure Survey showing this property being commercial with

residual homes." Ms. Cloutier then passed out pictures showing that the properties has been used as commercial they had a commissary, they sold goods, and gas, this property has always been commercially used. When zoning went into effect, I believe there was one, and as it was explained to us, that some parcel of land they didn't know really what to do with it, they moved it into an I-A category, which is quite limiting on what you can do; so we was faced with the challenge as property owners, two parcels zoned B-3 and the two zoned I-A we was simply trying to get it all into one zoning category, back to it's original zone. We ask for a request to amend/correct it, not change it. We have absolutely no particular project on the books right now, we are hoping to go, again, through a series of steps, to get our zoning all in one place and start to clean the property up. Start looking possibly for to sell interesting land. We haven't ruled out go to surrounding property owners to see if they want to keep it as is. I was called prior to the October meeting from one of the property owners that he might be interested in buying part of it and putting his office there, which is already in a commercial zoning area." Ms. Cloutier also passed out pictures on how the land looks today. Ms. Cloutier, stated, "Most importantly the commercial elements is already around it. Mr. Danny Methvin has large silos, commercial equipment including 18-whellers that is all park right across the streets. Ms. Cloutier also mentioned that Tommy Grocery is across the street from one of the property owners, that's appealing the decision. It's really entirely a commercial area, again our hope was to get all our zoning put together, clean the property up and looking at potential opportunity for sale including residential. We feel that we went through the proper protocol. We followed all the rules of the Planning and Zoning Commission, and honestly they ruled in our favor."

Councilman Paige, stated, "We're going to have a great discussion of this at the next months meeting, I'm thinking our hearts are saying to let both parties to come back, and the Council will vote it up or down."

Chairman Rachal, asked, "Ms. Cloutier, if we, the Parish Council, concur with the Zoning Commission. And we vote on it at one point, and leaving it like this. Will it affect any land owner around you?" "I'm not really clear on this zoning, but if we go along with the Commission at some point, by going along with their recommendation, Will this affect any other surrounding land owners and what they're using their land for right now?"

Ms. Cloutier, stated, "I absolutely can't see what affect it would have on them, in fact, I'm not really quite clear, what they want us to do with our property, except have it stay exactly as is. I honestly don't know why they're appealing."

Mrs. Joyce Perry, stated, "I own the property adjacent to where they want to turn into a 24/7 hour business, if I understand correctly that's what a B-3 is. I have a residential property, and my property is zoned as a R-2 with special exceptions. My special exceptions is that I'm a dog groomer. I typically do three dogs a day, the person comes and leaves the dog. I groom them and when I'm finished, I call them and they pick them up."

I'm not opened at night, I'm usually closed before 5:00pm. You can not consider my business a 24 hour, B-3 business. I have no noise and the traffic. Cars come in to drop off and leave. I call them and they come pick up and leave. There is no noise. If you guys leaves this decision and said that it was an error, our property value would go to nothing. We'll be boxed in. We'll have a 24/7 part over there, we'll have Tommy's across the road, which when we bought the property in December of 2012 we knew about Tommy's. We was told their land was just a family owned plot, I even try to buy the Aunts, Margaret Shaw's property and she refused to sell it, based on she was waiting to see what the rest of the family does. I offered to buy it faster, just tell me what she wanted for it. She said she's going to wait to see what the rest of the family does. We are stuck, this is suppose to be a residential area, the property right next to us is a wooded lot zoned as an I-A, and on the other side it's zoned a B-3, which was the commissary and another B-3 for the Bed and Breakfast, at one time this was all farming, we didn't buy our property for our value to go down, we're on the river, please realize that we love our house and the property, we don't want to jeopardize our value. You guys need to ask yourself, "Do you want to live next to a property that's zoned a B-3 with a 24 hour, seven days a week business that goes there?", "What if a night club would buy that?" "What would a Dollar General or even another convenient store will buy it, or a super duper that will sell gas, What would that do to your property value? I would truly like to know?"

Mr. James Atherton, stated, "It does affect me." "I have property across the river from that, and, of course, that is my scenic view of the river and my comments are in that appeal, as far as what the detrimental effect is."

Ms. Cloutier, stated, "In due respect, for decades we had a beautiful green belt view of this gentleman's property, and it was all torn down and a subdivision was put in place and you never heard from us, because that is called, "Progress", it's called, "life." "And these fine individuals knew when they bought property they were looking in the back of property that has always used commercially, always, before a turn of a century. And we had a beautiful belt view too, Sir, and it's gone, but that ok."

Councilman Paige asked a question, "If this Council vote to leave as is by the Planning and Zoning Commission, "How would it be beneficial to the people of this Parish, if business was put out there, as tax dollars coming into this Government body,?" "That's a question we need to look at."

Mr. Tony Hernandez, "I appreciate what you said earlier, Sir, about looking into it, but this has been looked into so long., I'm one of the property owners, actually on an I-A, If I'm correct?" I live there, there is no business or nothing and like Melissa, mentioned earlier some sections was I-A, and I feel like my friends and neighbors are being held hostage by surrounding people, this went through proper channels, unanimous decisions. We live in a free country, I come from a communist country and I understands how it works. Your going to micro manage your Planning and Zoning Commission, we're wasting so much time right now because they've gone through this several times. It upsets me to see a waste of our tax dollars, and you're right it will bring tax dollars to our Parish for roads and everything else. I lost a view across from me too, and I didn't petition it. I wanted progress, we need the money in the Parish, there

is no plans for a 24 hour business going next door, there are all type of historical value in the area, there are all kind of tourism that goes up and down the road and we need to put an end to this either tonight are approve these people, so we all can continue, let's not linger it on."

Mr. Atherton, wanted to make one final comment. "This is the first time this come up to go to a B-3 Zoning, before it was tried to turn into an industrial complex across the river. I would like for you to review diligently on our appeals especially when it comes to the Ordinance itself, ok, and how it reads. Couple of things, one is, you can not rezone by your own rules just because you want to have a business there. You have to show all intent, a Business plan, and have it all mapped out and present it to the Zoning Commission to make a decision."

Councilman de Graffenried, asked, "So as I appreciate this, we're not doing a new zoning thing, we're reverting back to its previously zone. This is a reversion, this is fixing some mistake that was made in history?" Everyone said, "Yes." So this is not a brand new zoning we'll reverting back to what was previously done." stated Councilman de Graffenried again.

Mr. Atherton, replied, "Our understanding, it was zoned an I-A, and there is no proof, we've not seen no proof from the Zoning Commission that there was an error ever made, to answer you're question. That's an important point, but you can't just say it was an error made, you have to show at what point that error was made, but it wasn't, we didn't see any previous zoning showing that error."

Mr. Kent Gresham was next to speak. He identified himself as a developer in Natchitoches. He said he developed a subdivision called Lambre's Gin Natchez. Mr. Gresham stated, "I want to go back about a year ago, part of Lambre's Gin, we had the Gin and the Commissary right next door, that commissary has been zoned for a restaurant and a Club it's backed up to my subdivision and property I personally own. Ricky LaCour and his wife are great people and they're putting something out there to create jobs. How I came into this was in last March, originally it was going to be a Beer Place and so if we going to have a Beer Place out here let's have a restaurant to go with it, so I started to look into it, I talked to Rick, about it. So we looked at the Old Commissary and the land and the entire strip right there. One thing to keep into consideration, it's not just business, if I want to buy it I can build houses, and I don't think anyone would object to that, and there going to be 24 hour houses, people will live there 24 hours a day, so I put together a contingency plan on the Old Commissary, the wooded area, next to your house, a twelve foot fence that area will be used for parking, a restaurant and the rest would be developed for houses. This is a project that could cost 3.3 million dollars this is my budget. This will create about 250 jobs, Construction, roads, and 75 full-time jobs. This is a huge project there is a lot of riverbank there. I never had a restaurant open past 10:00pm. I don't have night clubs, I do restaurants, and yes, we serve beer and wine. The point I'm making there is People like me are looking for places like this and that you have to look at the broader picture and that I doubt there will be a 24 hours, and that's a scary word. You can put a provision in there, we do it all the time, with a restriction of certain hours of operations, the Historic District has it, you can't have bands to play to 3:00am in the morning, the Mariner's has it, remember, when they built the docks. It's a broader way to look at it. To answer your question, the best questioned anybody asked, What about the project? How much its going to bring? and I understand about the people across the river and I think everyone does, they have a lot of expensive homes over there, so does Lambre's Gin and we built 60 houses out there no one has complained

and look at the progress the Rhodes Brothers, and you guys with the permit for millions of dollars. Someone like me is going to back off and go somewhere else or someone like me is going to come in and spend the money, I will like for you to make a decision and move on with it, I totally respect the idea of your home, that you're surrounded by progress, and I understand that, when the home got burned down and got rebuilt and yal moved in, it's just what it is, I'm speaking as a developer, a potential developer, just want you to consider that."

Mr. Perry, stated, "I just want yal to consider that none of the laws was followed in this process. There was no building plans presented, all of that is in front of you, nothing was followed, for getting a B-3 for this piece of property." Melissa Cloutier, responded, "We don't have a project on the books just yet." Mr. Perry, replied, "There no project, no laws was followed. For a project, plans has to be submitted to be able to be considered a B-3, what's going to go in there?" "You just can't write a blank check and give them a B-3 and say to put in whatever you want to." Ms. Cloutier, replied, "It has always been commercial property we're asking to correct the zoning, not to change it." Mr. Perry, stated, "When it comes to our appeal, the gentleman earlier up there, stated, "That yal should not vote this down, we're going to open up a can of worms." "What is the appeal process for?"

Councilman Paige, asked Mr. Lemoine a question, "Did they follow the procedure of the B-3? Mr. Lemoine, replied, "In my opinion, yes, they are trying to revert back to the historical view of the property. It has been commercial property over a hundred years." Councilman Paige, stated, "I've sit here over twenty some years, and I can certainly tell you, I'm not one to try to sit here and vote over what the Planning Commission does. It carries a lot of weight with me when you said they voted unanimously and I know that's not a joke. Mrs. Ward, stated about sending it on to the next month meeting, the process is just what it is, this is the first time I have heard of this until tonight. To say to vote on it right now, I'll feel good either way I vote tonight, but one thing for sure I don't have a problem in waiting until next month, we don't need to be hastily to do anything, I hope we all can get along, and wait until next month and the decision will be what it will be, lets do that and go on."

Ms. Perry wanted the Council to take time to get a copy of the recording of the meeting from the Parish and Zoning meeting. The problem came from when she was asked what she was zone as and she said she was a B-3 by special exceptions. She said after she looked at her paperwork she was zoned a R-2 with special exceptions, If you listen to the recording its a long pause, no one of the Council members said nothing for a period long time, and one of the Council members finally said, "If you're a zone 3, then we'll we might as well keep it a zone 3." This is how, the decision was made. There was no evidence brought to what plans was going to be made, and like Ms. Cloutier said, "At this time they have no Plans." If you let it go as a B-3 anything can go there with no plans intended. I know the idea big money better, I'm a home owner we bought that property to live outside the City Limits and to be happy, I do dogs, you can't compare my business to something that is going to be zoned a B-3, which allowed to be a 24 hour business."

Ms. Connie Keppinger, stated, "I lived down river past the property. I'm certain very sympathetic to the property owners and I think it's a wonderful idea to have a multi million dollar development, however, I would like to proposed another point of view, I'm a very small business owner and I would like to consider, "Don't throw the baby out with the bath water" I would like to put a small nursery and plant business there, it will definitely would close early. That would be my dream and I'm family friends with the Cloutier's and I've been looking at that property for years and I dreamed of having a small business

there. There is other possibilities for development without it being a 24/7 business. I would also like for you to consider what the other gentleman said economic development and tourism that is down river. You have the National Park Service and people who travels down the river and I think it will be a wonderful opportunity to have a few more commercial interest for them to be able visit and take advantage and leave their tax dollars in our community. I feel the property can be developed and at the same time be sympathetic to the property owners.

Chairman Rachal, stated, "Personally what I've heard tonight and seen tonight I'm making a motion that we deny the appeal." Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "In all respect to all parties involved, it was brought to us tonight and in all fairness you have presented us with information, think we need to take a closer look at it and come back next month to make a decision, in all fairness. I believe in all fairness, I could not make a fair vote tonight." Councilman Paige, stated, "If we can have a discussion, I've sit here and saw much bigger problems than this, I believe it's a middle ground somewhere, I don't know, I think that's possible." Chairman Rachal, continued, to try to get a second to his motion. Councilman de Graffenried, ask the Parish Attorney to give his opinion on this. District Attorney Kip Fair, stated, "I was asked what the appeal process was, and I issued a written opinion on that. I have not looked at the original application and I was just provided a copy of the appeals application. Generally the function of the Council, which use to be the Jury heard any parties that was wanting to appeal the decision of our Planning Commission. They can do so to the Jury or Council and they do this by written notification and they've done that. Greg showed me a copy of that tonight and in general the Council can take the time to look at it at the next meeting or make a their decision based on what the Planning and Zoning Commission has already ruled on. There is a process which the Council adopt with Commission which includes advertisement, which includes Public Hearing, which includes the application process and the Commission makes the decision. The Council can accept that decision, They can send it back to the Commission, or the can override it, but the process beyond this, is District Court.

Councilman Paige, stated, "Mr. Rachal, I know you made your motion, but we have not heard from the other two Councilmen. I would love to hear from the other Council members before you make your motion." Councilman Bedgood, stated, "I live 45 miles from here, I have no idea where it's at, and whose in favor of what. I respect him (Greg)of what his decision is, but as far as me, I don't feel like I can sit here and make a decision tonight on what I heard from both sides, because I don't know where the properties at, I probably haven't seen the property because I'm not a frequent visitor to Natchitoches, I know I'm a Council member and represent everyone, but I can't say if I'll vote yes or no."

There was still conversation between Councilman Paige and Chairman Rachal. Chairman Rachal, stated, "My motion still stands, and if I don't get a second it dies for lack of a second." At this time Councilman de Graffenried wanted to asked the Parish Attorney another question, "In your opinion, Sir, Did the planning and Zoning Commission followed their guidelines?" Parish Attorney, state, "I don't know, I haven't looked at them, I can't answer that because I haven't looked at any application or anything, but speaking the Commission is pointed by this Council to do a job and their job is to review planning and zoning decisions, we have a commission pointed by this Council, and we have a Planning and Zoning Director and their bound to follow the Ordinances and Code of Planning and Zoning. I don't know whether they did or didn't, but I agree with Mr. Duty, that had spoken earlier, that if the Council wants to review the decisions of the Commission

that they have appointed, they have the absolute rights to do that, this council haven't seen this a lot, but Mr. Paige and myself have seen this a lot on the Jury, it's a process that every citizens has the rights to appeal, and this body is the appeal. I've been on that side of appealing many times, you have to the right to review the material and put it on the next agenda, but the 45 days, in my opinion, the 45 days is to file your notice and get on the next available hearing. The Council is suppose to hear this problem and make a decision within the first 45 days of the review, and this hearing was very quick."

Ms. Carolyn Roy, asked, "Was there a second to that?" Councilman de Graffenried, stated, "I'm going to second it."

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby deny the appeal filed by Joyce Perry of a Zoning amendment/correction for the SOPEC Trust, Peter Cloutier Trust and Margaret Cloutier Shaw of a parcel of land. Approved in the October 3rd, Planning and Zoning Meeting.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|----------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Abstain: | Councilman Bedgood |
| Nayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Nayes: | Councilman Paige |

Motion Not Passed

Councilman Paige, stated, "I would like to make another motion, to table this matter until next month meeting." Chairman Rachal, wasn't satisfied with the motion outcome, so he asked, Parish Attorney, "What do we do in a case of one Abstain, 2 ayes, and 2 Nayes?" District Attorney stated, "It's a tie, and since there is no provision in the charter for a tie breaker, it remains a tie." There were more discussion and Councilman Rachal still didn't understand, so District Attorney went through it again and stated, "There is no provision in the charter for a tie, the council has three choices. They can deny the appeal, accept the appeal, or table the appeal."

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby hear it at the next month meeting the appeal filed by Joyce Perry of a Zoning amendment/correction for the SOPEC Trust, Peter Cloutier Trust and Margaret Cloutier Shaw of a parcel of land. Approved in the October 3rd, Planning and Zoning Meeting.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|--------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Nayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Nayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was to consider adopting a resolution confirming re-appointment/appointments to the following boards/commissions.

- a. Confirmation of Mr. Joseph W. Darby, III for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Tourist Commission Board.

On motion by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby re-appoint Mr. Joseph W. Darby, III to the Natchitoches Parish Tourist Commission Board.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

- b. Confirmation of Mr. Mathew G. Culpepper for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Fire District 5 Board.

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby re-appoint Mr. Mathew G. Culpepper for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Fire District 5 Board.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

- c. Confirmation of Mr. Ralph Hernandez for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Fire District 5 Board.

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby re-appoint Mr. Ralph Hernandez for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Fire District 5 Board.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

- d. Confirmation of Ms. Anita Dubois for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Children and Youth Planning Board.

On motion by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover, duly seconded by Councilman Chris Paige, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby re-appoint Ms. Anita Dubois for re-appointment to the Natchitoches Parish Children and Youth Planning Board.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was for Council to consider Introduction of Ordinance 13-2016 for Budget Revisions to the 2016 Budget.

Ms. Miley, explained everyone was mailed a copy this was only for introduction only next month you need to vote on it. Ms. Miley advised the Council to review the material and if they have any questions they could give her a call.

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby introduce Ordinance 13-2016 for Budget Revisions to the 2016 Budget.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda was for Council to consider adoption of a resolution for the annual certification of compliance with the requirements of the Federal Off-System Bridge Replacement Program.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt a resolution for the annual certification of compliance with the requirements of the Federal Off-System Bridge Replacement Program.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda to consider authorizing the Parish President to advertise for right-of-way appraisals and other services as required for the acquisition of right-of-way for the upcoming Federal Bridge Replacement projects on Clark Road, Good Hope Road, and Robeline-Provencal Road [State Project No. H.010943]

Mr. Verret, explained they have three projects coming up for replacement and the Parish is task is to require right-of-ways for those and we need title work done and if we don't get them as donations we'll have to get appraisers done.

On motion by Councilman Russell Rachal, duly seconded by Councilman Chris Paige, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby authorize the Parish President to advertise for right-of-way appraisals and other services as required for the acquisition of right-of-way for the upcoming Federal Bridge Replacement projects on Clark Road, Good Hope Road, and Robeline-Provencal Road [State Project No. H.010943]

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|-------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda to consider authorizing the Parish President to contract for needed bridge repairs.

The Council wanted to know what was this about. Mr. Verret explained that we they had done the annual bridge inspections that we're required to do, and between the biannual every other year inspection by DOTD we determined there are some piling need to be splice and some other repairs that needs to be done. We're trying to take a proactive approach so DOTD want come back next year do their annual inspections and find some of these issues and have to close bridges. It will be much better if we can go ahead and take care of these problems now and have the bridge to remain opened, so basically we just want to contract out these repairs, these repairs should not exceed \$25,000, shouldn't even be close to that. Councilman Paige wanted to know where are the bridges. Mr. Verret informed Councilman Paige, there are several all over the parish, couple on Government Road, he would have to go back through the files to see which ones they have inspected this year. Councilman Paige wanted to know. So they're all through out the Parish correct? Mr. Verret, replied, "Yes." "I don't have a problem with that," stated Councilman Paige.

On motion by Councilman Chris Paige, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby consider authorizing the Parish President to contract for needed bridge repairs.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to consider introduction Ordinance 9-2016 that the salaries of Parish Government Department heads directly reporting to the Parish President are reported as individual line items in the preparation and presentation of the Parish Government Operating Budget.

"I'm speechless, I think we need an easier way to see what our Department Heads makes, and easier form than having to go through the Operating Budget." stated, Councilman Doug de Graffenried. "We need to be able to compare and see what every Department Head makes."

Parish President stated, "I actually like this one." Instead of having a two hundred page budget looking for a salary over here and a salary over there, I would like to just have a one page appendix that list all the Department Heads and Salaries are listed on one sheet of paper and the table of content will say, "Salaries of Department Heads pages 1-114 or whatever; so otherwise you wouldn't have to go through all the funds to check salaries, that's if yal allow us to do that, I'll be happy to do that."

Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "I think that is sort of the essence I'm trying to do."

Chairman Rachal, asked, "Are we talking about salaries or salary range?" "Talking about salaries", replied, Parish President. "Actual Salaries," stated Chairman Rachal again, "Yes, actual salaries," replied, Parish President. Parish President explained again there will be a section that will only be Department Heads salaries so you don't have to look all over the budget for them, that will be a better way of doing it.

Councilman Paige, stated, "This something I didn't support, that night, and I'm probably not going to support this night." But it's something I just can't support." "I can deal with that", replied Parish President.

On motion by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby introduce Ordinance 9-2016 that the salaries of Parish Government Department heads directly reporting to the Parish President are reported as individual line items in the preparation and presentation of the Parish Government Operating Budget.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Nays: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to consider Ordinance 10-2016 that beginning with the 2017 Operating Budget no Parish Government Department head reporting directly to the Parish President shall have a salary and benefit package as reported on form W-2 that is equal to or exceeds the salary package of the Parish President.

Councilman de Graffenried explained there are some Department Heads making more than the Parish President and he wants to cap the salaries of the Department Heads. Councilman Bedgood, stated, "This for someone new?" Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "There is someone already making more than he is." "I understand that", replied Councilman de Graffenried. "So what are you saying?" asked Councilman Bedgood. Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "I'm saying here in the Ordinance it caps it."

Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "This does not make sense." Councilman de Graffenried, stated, "It pretty much does make sense, I'm saying the salaries of no Department Head can't exceed \$80,000. There are exceptions in here, the Parish can approve a person that exceeds this range because of tenure but in the real world no employees unless they have specialized knowledge make more than the CEO."

Councilwoman Hoover, asked the question, "Do we raise the salary of the Parish President?" "You can't do that", quickly answered, Parish President, Nowlin. Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "Listen up this is what I'm asking, I'm trying to get some understanding, because it just doesn't make sense to me. Do we raise the salary of the President, and everybody said, "NO", because you already have someone making beyond the President." "I understand that", replied Councilman de Graffenried. "Will that person's salary go back down?", asked Councilman Bedgood. Councilman de Graffenried, stated, "There is actual two sections employees is paid out of two streams it can be approved by the Parish Council and a long term employee can be approved by the Parish Council for matters of tenure, for matters of special circumstances that can be approved by the Parish Council.

"Do your homework for next month and you'll see there are more than one employee that makes more than the Parish President.", stated Councilman Chris Paige.

Parish President, stated "I'm not clear on a few things. Talking about Salary and Benefit Packages, comparing an employee package based on my salary. I volunteered to waive retirement, health care, automobile, and cell phone, things like that. It's saving the parish over \$30,000 a year. So if somebody else's salary and benefit is going to be limited to my salary, when they add benefits to it?" "Salary cap should be exclusive of benefits, so if you would start receiving those benefits then the cap will revert to that number", stated Councilman de Graffenried. "Don't you draw more than \$80,000?" asked Councilman Bedgood. "Well, it has been some COLA increases, it's like \$81,000 now, every year it's been like a three quarter or 1 percent adjustment." stated, Parish President. Parish President expressed, you're adopting an Ordinance that will cap certain ones, whether it's one, two, three

or four, we have several that is bumping pretty close, ok which means that there are going to max out at some point, they're going to become unhappy because they can't get the cost of living increases. Another point that we're talking about an Ordinance concerning certain salaries we haven't really addressed the Policy Manual with has a schedule of salaries ranges, if you're going to do this, I think that is where you need to make those changes at, I'm saying this is for the proper placement of the Ordinance."

"That happens to be part of another Ordinance, that's coming up again, this body has the right to make an exception, it's written into this Ordinance. The rights to realize that you'll going to have employees that twenty years of the Parish because of COLA are going to bump this, Parish Council has the right to say Okay, here's an employee they are there, we can approve that." stated Council de Graffenried.

Parish President, replied, "I don't know the answer tonight, we have to review at the next meeting to see how it support the Home Rule Charter, the President has the right to come to selecting Department Heads, and I'm concerned this caps will take away from the Parish President."

Chairman Rachal, stated, "It does say that you as the President can pay anyone from the minimum to maximum salary subject to Council approval, we'll cross that bridge when we get to it."

Councilman Paige, stated, "As long as they have that salary range that sits before us, there nothing we need to know, and on the other note, you're stepping out in some stuff now, because the Library Director makes more than the current individual, we're going to tell the Library Board, "Look when you go out to recruit these people, that you have to recruit them for less than, and they're coming from all over the United States to get here." Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "Whose money is the Library Board Money, Is it the tax payer money?" There were other comments made between Councilman Paige and Councilman de Graffenried. Councilwoman Hoover, on the other hand wanted to hear about the Judges people and Cathy Creamer, our HR person stated, "The Judges people have nothing to do with this." But, she does not know about if it will be affect something later when it comes to the FLSA part, which will be presented later on in the meeting. I have spoken to one judge and the other judge was out of town and I'm waiting to speak with both judges, and it can be one way or the other."

Mrs. Creamer wanted to talk on what Councilman de Graffenried was talking about earlier about the salary exceeding the Parish President. Mrs. Creamer, stated, "We have the Department Head that makes dollar wise salary less than Mr. Nowlin, but today her insurance is single and the rate is about \$800.00 a month if her/his salary package goes to change and they would add family with the way our insurance is increasing if you take salary and plus their insurance and add that up they can go over Mr. Nowlin's salary. We'll be punishing them for having family coverage." "It's just for base salary, exclusive of pensions and benefits, Base Salary." stated Councilman de Graffenried.

On motion by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby introduce Ordinance 10-2016 that beginning with the 2017 Operating Budget no Parish Government Department head reporting directly to the Parish President shall have a salary and benefit package as reported on form W-2 that is equal to or exceeds the salary package of the Parish President.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Absent: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to the Council to Consider Ordinance 11-2016 directs the Parish President to present to the Council for approval by January 2017 a plan to broadcast in real time the proceedings of any properly called meeting of the Natchitoches Parish Council. The digital record of each meeting, both audio and video shall be archived on the computer servers owned by Natchitoches Parish and readily and easily accessible to the public.

Councilman de Graffenried wants the Council meeting to be a live streaming video. Councilman de Graffenried feels this should be done in order so resident can see the meetings live and free to the public. See the residents can see all the Governmental deliberations. Anyone who wants to look in, its free of charge.

Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "I need to add something. We already do audio, and you're speaking of video, as well, Where in the world we're going to get this money? and How much is this going to cost the Parish for this to be done?"

Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "You can do it for a couple of hundred dollars." "A couple hundred dollars per month?," replied, Councilwoman Hoover. "No, a couple hundred dollars you will buy a couple, basically, small cameras that can be remotely operated. You will put it on a service like, "You Tube" or "Facebook" there is no hosting fee, it's very cheap." replied Councilman de Graffenried.

Councilman Paige, stated, "We had done something like this at one time we voted for the Police Jury to do this, Didn't we Ms. Debbie?" Ms. Debbie, replied, "Yes." and then, Councilman Paige, gave a brief summary on the camera in the Boardroom. Councilwoman Hoover, asked Councilman de Graffenried, "Do you have a package on, How it will be set up or you going to have that for us next month?" Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "That will be micro-managing a decision, we'll let the Executive Branch handle it." Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "No, we can't let the Executive Branch handle it, we as the Council have to make a decision about it. If you're bringing something before the Council...." At that time both Councilman de Graffenried and Councilman Bedgood began to talk and others started to talk and Councilwoman Hoover never finished what she was saying. Councilman de Graffenried explained, "I wrote the form and the content, I'm willing to talk about the functionality, there is several ways this can be done and I don't think we need to sit in here and pick out Internet server or cameras anything like that, we just give the Parish President, a little freedom to say, "This is how you going to Broadcast it."

Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "No, if it's costing money, we need to know." Councilman de Graffenried, stated, "If it cost more than \$200.00, I'll pay for the difference." Councilwoman Hoover, replied, "Very Good."

Parish President, Rick Nowlin expressed he kind of like this one too, however, I have two comments, just food for thought. Of course, the cost, What it's going to cost and where it's coming from. I don't have any ideas, I'm not a video person and the second thing is that since these are Parish Council Meetings the Council Clerk should be responsible for the program. I have no problem in assisting as far as the set up and investigation of it, but I think the authority for the recording and broadcasting should be on the, Parish Council." Councilman de Graffenried, stated, "I'm willing." Parish President, stated, "I've already spoken with the Clerk about this." Councilman Paige, asked the Parish Clerk, "Call, Catherine to see if there were any type of equipment in the past that does this."

Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "It's two things, it's the streaming and to be live, and it's not just recording."

On motion by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby introduce Ordinance 11-2016 directs the Parish President to present to the Council for approval by January 2017 a plan to broadcast in real time the proceedings of any properly called meeting of the Natchitoches Parish Council. The digital record of each meeting, both audio and video shall be archived on the computer servers owned by Natchitoches Parish and readily and easily accessible to the public.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|-------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to consider introducing Ordinance 12- 2016 amending ordinance 005-2015 which would divide the current Parish of Natchitoches Personnel Manual into two separate manuals one containing the personnel policies and the other containing the job descriptions of Parish employees.

Councilman de Graffenried instead of having this huge Personnel Manual, it will broken down into parts. First Part will list all the Salaries of everyone, and the second part will list all the job description of each employee. Councilman de Graffenried, explained that when a change(s) needing to be done the Parish President or Department Head will bring the change(s) to the Council for approval, instead of having to vote on the whole manual, just the current requested change(s).

There was a lengthy discussion on this matter also, but it was only for introduction, and it will have to be voted on in a Public Hearing at the next month meeting.

On motion by Councilwoman Patsy Ward Hoover duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby introduce Ordinance 12- 2016 amending ordinance 005-2015 which would divide the current Parish of Natchitoches Personnel Manual into two separate manuals one containing the personnel policies and the other containing the job descriptions of Parish employees.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilman Paige
Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to to consider introducing a resolution ordering that the Parish Council receive formal proposals for all auditing services performed on behalf of and at the request of the Natchitoches Parish Council.

Councilman de Graffenried explained when you look at the Budget there are lot of Auditing fees the Parish's pays and I don't know how you go by selecting an Auditor and how long its been since we reviewed having other Auditors come in.

Parish President had some concerns about this item. Parish President informed the Council he was aware of only one CPA firm in the City that does public audits. There are others in surrounding parishes that do. Parish President stated, "I think it's important, it always important that you look at the cost of any service you're getting by contract. I think it's also important you don't look just at cost, you also look at it's being relative close and to go to local people. You particularly have a firm that is use to the way we've been operating and they're not starting with a blank sheet of paper and knows how our Audit looked like last year and they know where the problem errors are and they can zero in on it pretty quick; so it doesn't take that long and doesn't cost us much perhaps. I think there's a benefit of using a firm, year after year. For being a professional service, I don't necessarily base my decision on a doctor, or lawyer, or dentist on how much it's going to cost me, I go to the one I have confidence in and thinking I'm getting a reasonable service for a reasonable price. Those are my concerns and I'm not sure how we address those, I'm just wanting to throw them out."

Councilman de Graffenried responded by saying, "You're saying then, You don't know what the other prices will be and you're making the "Arthur Anderson argument, because we have used them in the past, they are obviously the best ever." "We may go through the process and may not change anything." Parish President, stated, "That is not, at all what I was saying, maybe I didn't say it very well, that is not at all what I said. I

said there are others available in surrounding parishes, and there is a benefit to using people that are familiar with your operations, and familiar with your financial operations and it's always a benefit of using local people. I'm not saying we use somebody that is local and their cost is absorbing, I wouldn't do that.

Councilman Paige asked, "Is there some government bodies or Government Agencies that can not continuously using the same CPA Auditing firm after so many years, four or five year, or whatever, by statute?" "I'm just asking the questions because some organizations do change up." Parish President, stated, "I'm not aware of that."

Councilman de Graffenried asked, "How long have we had that contractual agreement with our current auditor?" "It's an annual contract, stated, Parish President. "How long have we annually renewed it?" asked Councilman de Graffenried. "We have had the current ones since the three(3)years since I've been here." Prior to that, "How long was it?" asked Councilman de Graffenried. Councilman Paige replied, "You're talking years and years."

Chairman Rachal, asked "Do we have a certain number that we're paying every year, set fee or does it fluctuate?" Chairman Rachal stated "I've noticed in the amendments" before he could finish Ms. Miley, stated I wasn't aware I needed to know this.

Councilman de Graffenried explained it appears in several different categories. and Ms. Miley explained to the Councilman "Yes it does, it splits every funds pays. Chairman Rachal, stated, "Some was \$500.00 and some of them." he didn't finish, Ms. Miley, stated, "It's based on amount of time spent on each funds."

Councilman Paige, stated, "I don't have a problem with the current way the business is handled. Johnson, Thomas, and Cunningham have been some real stand up guys. Mark has been excellence down through the years. He's been an outstanding guy, I must be truthful about it."

Relative to this, the Council Clerk explained to the Council they did not have to introduce a Resolution, a Resolution must be voted on at that present time. The Council Clerk then asked the Parish Attorney was she correct on this procedure. At that time, Chairman Rachal, stated, "The agenda was posted as an introduction and it was posted and the public thought we was just introducing it and they wouldn't have a chance to be here to discuss it, so we can't legally vote on it tonight, It was posted on the wall as an Introduction." The Clerk responded by telling Chairman Rachal, "I was just asking a question, to make sure we're doing it correct." The Parish Attorney responded by saying, "A Resolution does not require a public comment." The Chairman, asked, "It doesn't require a Public Comment?" The Parish Attorney stated, "Our Clerk was right." After this was confirmed, Chairman Russell Rachal, read the item, by saying the next item is for Council to consider to adopt a Resolution ordering the Parish Council to receive formal proposals for all auditing services performed on behalf of and at the request of the Natchitoches Parish Council.

On motion by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, duly seconded by Councilman Russell Rachal, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt a Resolution ordering the Parish Council to receive formal proposals for all auditing services performed on behalf of and at the request of the Natchitoches Parish Council.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|--------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Nayes: | Councilman Bedgood |
| Nayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Nayes: | Councilman Paige |

Motion Not Passed

Chairman Rachal stated the next item on the agenda is for Council to consider adopting a resolution ordering the Parish Council to receive proposals by the end to the second quarter of 2017 for a vendor to act as the broker for all insurance policies necessary for the functioning of Parish Government and the benefit of Parish employees.

Councilman de Graffenried stated these Resolutions goes hand and hand the Parish need to reach out to other vendors or agents to handle the proposals for all insurance(s) policies necessary for the functioning of Parish Government and the benefit of Parish employees. The Parish needs to know other pricing for other agents around.

Councilman Paige asked, "if there was an agent of record for the present time?" Assistant District Attorney, replied, "You voted on that last month to keep the same agents." Ms. Miley, replied, "You vote on it every year, and these have been the agents from the previous years." Councilwoman Hoover, asked "When does this contract ends?" Chairman Rachal, replied, "It will end at the end of next year."

Councilman de Graffenried expressed he knew the Council had approved the same agents for next year, this Resolution will take into effect in 2018.

Councilwoman Hoover, asked Ms. Miley, "Did you ever get the information for us on the percentages on what these agents are getting for the different types of coverage's?" Ms. Miley, replied, "I gave them to Sheryl." The Council Clerk, replied, "I sent them straight to you and emailed them to you." Councilman Paige, replied, "We all need that information." Councilwoman Hoover, stated as well, "We all need it." The Council Clerk, stated, "I apologize, I only gave it to Councilwoman Hoover, because she asked for it, but I will get copies for the other Council members."

On motion by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, duly seconded by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adopt a resolution ordering the Parish Council to receive proposals by the end to the second quarter of 2017 for a vendor to act as the broker for all insurance policies necessary for the functioning of Parish Government and the benefit of Parish employees.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

Ayes: Councilman de Graffenried
Ayes: Councilman Bedgood
Ayes: Councilman Rachal
Ayes: Councilwoman Hoover
Ayes: Councilman Paige

Motion Passed

Chairman Rachal then recognized Mr. Nick Verret, Director of Public Works, Mr. Verret, stated, "Since it's been a lengthy meeting, I sent my reports in your packages and if you have any questions, I'll be happy to answer." At this time Councilman Bedgood wanted to know if an Assistant Director have been hired. Nick Verret answered, "I'm still working on it" Parish President, answered, "No we have not." Councilman Bedgood stated, "The word I got today was he had already got the job." Both Parish President and Mr. Verret stated, "That's news to me." Councilwoman Hoover, stated, "I have heard that also." Councilman Bedgood said, "I have something else, I've already heard what the salary was." The question was asked, "Who are you talking about?" Councilman Bedgood, replied, "Johnny said, I have it, and I was offered \$45,000." Parish President, stated, "Assistant Director?", Councilman Bedgood, stated "yep." Councilman Bedgood, stated, "I have one more thing I want to ask, my mileage and then Councilman Bedgood, looked over and told, Chairman Rachal, "I'm proud you're getting your work done, his referring to Chairman Rachal. He continued to say my mileage and his mileage is just a few more than mine. We both have 400 some miles, last month, Chairman Rachal had \$93,925.45 of work done compared to my \$37,000.00, this month in the report Chairman Rachal got \$73,000 and I got \$39,000.00 which is a difference of \$90,000 in two months, and then I figured up the rocks that went in District 5 was \$19,000 dollars and hardly any in District 4. Can you explain why there was so much more work was done in District 5 and not comparable to District 4?" Mr. Verret answered, by saying, "Have you gone back to look at the amount your District received following the storm? Your District got more at that time following the storm." Councilman Bedgood, "Yes, but you got reimbursed by FEMA for that work, I still have gravel roads in horrible shape and black top roads in horrible shape." Councilman Bedgood stated, "\$90,000 is a lot of money."

Parish President stated, "We did not get reimbursed by FEMA for most of that, we only get reimburse 25% of what they approve and what they have approved, we haven't even gotten the money yet." Councilman Bedgood stated, "I understand that, When I look at it \$90,000 in two month is a lot of difference in two districts."

Parish President stated, "Well, if you want to a look at a two months window, Sir, you need to look at it at longer period of time, I don't know what the numbers compared over a longer period of time." Chairman Bedgood, stated, "I bet if you go back and look it's not a difference between District 5 and District 4 in the last three years." Councilman Bedgood explained both District usual run about the same, but sometimes District 5 runs a little more around a \$1,000 more but when it runs \$30,000 and \$90,000 it throws a flag up to me."

Mr. Verret stated, "You're looking at a snap shot and if you look at the long term, I think if you go back to the storm you'll see all the money that have been spent in response to all that it's probably more in your District." Councilman Bedgood, stated, "I'm not arguing with it". Mr. Verret stated, "He'll go back and do a year to date on it for the Council." Councilman Bedgood, stated, "I don't have anything else."

Councilwoman Hoover, asked Parish President did he say, "What's the point?" and Parish President stated, "Yes, What's the point." and then Councilman Paige, stated, "The point is Fairness, Fairness is the Point." Then Councilman Bedgood, asked, "The Point of What?" then Parish President explained the work has been done on the roads by priority basis and that is what Mr. Verret is doing."

There still was a lengthy discussion on grader workers and discussion on the size of Councilman Bedgood District. Then the Council began to talk about their miles. Chairman Russell Rachal, asked Mr. Verret, "Does those graders have anyway of telling how long they've ran top speed for the day? How long the blade stayed down? Anyway of reporting that? Is there anyway we can get that information from the last month if so?" Mr. Verret, stated, "I have to see what type of report we can print. Maybe a program named Care track from John Deere can be installed to get that information." Chairman Rachal, stated, "On the Kistachie Falls road, I went looked at it with a representative, you fixed about a 100 foot section with an under ground creek or something, running under it, but didn't touch it on either sides of it. It took just as much Diesel to get there to do that 100 and something foot as it did 2.1 mile of road. That's a waste of money, man power hours and everything. When I asked about it, I was told, the statement that was given from you, "You mean they didn't touch the rest of it" Why wouldn't you know that? You're the supervisor. I should not be telling information, someone should be following him to see what he's doing and not doing, because that was a waste of a lot of Diesel to do that one little job, and that's like this all over the Parish."

Mr. Verret stated, "You bring up a good point too, I've mentioned repeatedly we do not have a Supervisor level between worker level and Director Assistant. We desperately, desperately need those areas superintendents in various parts of the parish that can function in that supervisory level." Chairman Rachal, stated, "So nobody checks up on them" "That's not what I'm saying, Sir.", replied Mr. Verret. "We do as we're able to do between one or two of us, depends on my work load, engineering wise or administration wise. I might not be able to get into the field." Chairman Rachal, stated, "About three months ago we were told you put a list out on Mondays of work to be done, and in actuality there hasn't been a list since election. Is there a list or not?" Mr. Verret, stated, "Right now we're tweaking the scheduling system, up to this point, we have had so many requests, basically we actually have a long list of pending work needs to be done, and it's taking some tweaking with the electronic database that we're using and we have to get the IT guys involved in that too. We're working towards getting back to a scheduling system." Chairman Rachal, asked, "So are the operators strictly grading operators or you use them if it's wet to do something else?" Mr. Verret replied, "They be out looking at the roads." "When can we look for this list to be out again", replied, Chairman Rachal. "Hopefully soon." replied Mr. Verret.

Councilwoman Hoover wanted to asked a question, "What is the status of the Reclaim, Mr. Verret you're suppose to be getting from the State?" Mr. Verret, replied, "I did met with DOTD last week, I had a series of meetings, with them on Wednesday, I spoke with the area Engineer of DOTD, and they are waiting to make a decision on the RAP relation, I requested. DOTD have two major projects they are replacing some cross reams, one in Winn and the other is in our Parish. They want to make sure they have enough RAP to finish their project before they base their decision on what's left."

Councilman de Graffenried, asked, "What about Hampton Road?" Mr. Verret stated, "I met with a representative of Swepco and the property owners today, regarding the Power Pole issue the property owner is not going to have an issue in moving the pole and we can continue with the design phase" Councilman de Graffenried, asked it still not going to get done by the end of this year, correct." Mr. Verret, stated, "It's not the right time of the year to do it." Parish President, stated, "The goods news the resident is moving the power pole at their own cost and not the Parish's." Councilman de Graffenried, replied, "I like that."

Chairman Rachal then recognizes Ms. Sharon Harris, OCS/Head Start Executive Director, she gave her reports.

Ms. Harris wanted to give an update from last month, all Teachers and Aids have been hired, everybody is in place. However, we mentioned about the Educational Coordinator, we're finished interviews and the position has been offered to someone, Cathy is waiting on her response.

Councilman Bedgood, stated "I had a School Board representative to tell me to let Head Start know not to forget about them, they had 26 last year and they know no transportation will be given, they willing to bring them. They have a place, Head Start just need to provide the teachers, that's it, this is in the Goldonna area." Ms. Harris explained she will have to go out and do an assessment.

Chairman Rachal then recognizes Ms. Debbie Miley, Parish Treasurer, She stated she mailed out all her reports and asked if there were any questions at this time.

Councilman Doug de Graffenried, wanted to know, How is the Cash Flow? Ms. Miley reported it's Okay. Councilman de Graffenried wanted to what will happen if FEMA doesn't pay? "We'll still be okay", replied, Ms. Miley.

Chairman Rachal then recognizes Parish President, Rick Nowlin, Mr. Nowlin discussed his report by beginning with the Capital Outlay status, listed below:

CAPITAL OUTLAY UPDATE:

The following capital outlay applications are being prepared for submission to the State:

| | |
|------------------------------|-------------|
| Coco Bed Road | \$280,000 |
| Courthouse Security | \$760,000 |
| Old River Bridge | \$1,505,000 |
| OCS | \$ 350,000 |
| Payne Subdivision Streets | |
| Phase I: Miller Drive Bridge | \$100,000 |
| Phase II: Streets, Part A | \$400,000 |
| Phase III: Streets, Part B | \$515,000 |
| Harmony Road | \$1,890,000 |
| Goldonna Road | \$1,835,000 |
| Fish Hatchery Road | \$1,250,000 |
| Blanchard Road | \$280,000 |

Parish President reminded everyone about the two (2) Parish Sales Tax Propositions that's on the ballot for November 8, 2016. Parish President, informed everyone this election is a critical one because it's concerning transportation safety, emergency medical access, and it's also negatively impacts our opportunity for economic development and property value. Parish President also gave an update on Fire District 1 Board, and that later he will be receiving applications for applicants whose interested in serving on the Board due to two (2)

members resigning. Harry Hawthorne was name the new Board Chairman for Fire District 1 Board.

Parish President also informed he received at his home a letter concerning a disease called Dysautonomia Awareness Month. Parish President wanted to share with the Council and others about the content of the letter. October has been declared by Governor John Bell Edward to be Dysautonomia Awareness Month in Louisiana. Dysautonomia is a group of medical conditions that result in a malfunction of the automatic nervous system, which is responsible for "automatic" bodily functions such as respiration, heart rate, blood pressure, digestion, temperature control and more.

Parish President didn't have any other items to discuss unless someone have any questions of him. Chairman Rachal asked, "Have there been a Maintenance Supervisor named yet?"

Parish President replied, "No, Friday was the deadline for applications and we had several applications in, and I haven't had time to look and them, once we look at them then we'll be calling them in. I don't know how many or when we'll going to be doing that, this process is handled by Cathy."

Councilman Paige asked, "Do the CDC have a new CEO?", Parish President responded by saying "Yes." Councilman Paige replied, "Don't you need to tell them that?" Parish President explained he can't remember his name. Councilman Paige replied, "He's from Mississippi." and Parish President went further to explain the hiring process of the new CEO and the reported salary. At that time Councilman Paige found the name of the CEO and stated, "His name is Knox Ross."

On motion by Councilman Rodney Bedgood, duly seconded by Councilman Doug de Graffenried, that the Natchitoches Parish Council, in regular and legal session, does hereby adjourn.

On a roll call vote, the vote thereon was as follows:

| | |
|-------|---------------------------|
| Ayes: | Councilman Paige |
| Ayes: | Councilman de Graffenried |
| Ayes: | Councilman Rachal |
| Ayes: | Councilwoman Hoover |
| Ayes: | Councilman Bedgood |

Motion Passed

Since there was no other business the meeting was adjourn:

Attest:

Russell Rachal, Chairman

Sheryl Frederick,
Council Clerk